CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, LOS ANGELES ACADEMIC SENATE MINUTES November 19, 2024

ASM 24-8 DRAFT

A. Carnevali, B. Baker, D. Czypinski, D. Beamer, D. Rios Mojica, D. Vines, D. Stenstrom, E. Winokur, G. Simon-Cereijido, J. Garrison, K. Uomoto, M. Raspopov, M. Abdullah, M. Runnels, N. Warter-Perez, R. Joseph, R. Vogel, S. Keslacy, T. Jackson, Y. Cao

ABSENT

J. Phun

EXCUSED ABSENCE

Chair Avramchuk convened the meeting at 1:52 p.m.

Senator Meyerott read the Tongva land acknowledgement.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

- 1. 1.1 Chair's announcements:
 - 1.1.1 I would to remind everybody as a common courtesy to university shared governance, please do not schedule college or department meetings when Academic Senate is in session. Senate meetings are public forums, and the schedule is public knowledge. We welcome all community members to participate in Senate meetings.
 - 1.1.2 The Faculty Policy Committee (FPC) voted to reject the Interim Time, Place, and Manner Policy in its current form. The Executive Committee shared FPC's full rationale with our Academic Senate CSU Senators ahead of their 11/15/24 plenary session where the TPM policy was discussed.
 - 1.2 Senator Ramos announced: Tonight at 6:00 p.m., we are very fortunate to have the director, Monear Shaer, who is going to show his documentary and screen "Gaza Is Our Home". It will be held in the Library Community Room.
 - 1.3 Senator Chavez announced: Just a reminder to any faculty who are working with students on theses, projects, or dissertations this semester, the deadlines are less than a month away. So if you haven't advised your students to check in with the Graduate Resource Center about formatting and submission, please do so. Thank you.
 - 1.4 Senator Rodriguez announced: Just a reminder that tomorrow the Library is hosting a Library Collections Budget Town Hall, 3:00-4:15 p.m. You can register from the library website. Thank you, and I hope to see many of you there.
 - 1.5 Visitor Linda Lopez (Financial Aid and Scholarships) announced: I just wanted to let everyone know that the 2025-26 FAFSA has opened and is available to all students for submission. The Financial Aid office sent out a text message to all current Cal State LA students reminding them and encouraging them to submit their FAFSA since the original deadline was supposed to open December 1st. This is an opportunity for students to submit their application earlier than anticipated.
- 2. The following questions/concerns were raised from the floor:
 - In light of the agenda of the incoming Trump administration and the long failure of the university to address the needs of trans people on campus, what is the campus going to do protect trans people now?Do we have a timeline for the master plan and how we're (department or college) going to participate?
 - Given the incoming administration's promised assault on the mission, values, and vulnerable constituencies of Cal State LA, the tepid post-election email from senior administration was highly disappointing. How will the University as a whole (Admin, Academic Senate, ASI, faculty, staff, and students) address these threats?
 - Was there any funding available to campuses to implement or train people on the TPM policy that is now systemwide or any changes that may have occurred to their addendum? If not, is this something that we could do on our campus with maybe some learning communities or an FAQ page with how the policy will be implemented?
 - What is the campus doing to protect the most vulnerable people on our campus?
 - Many students in housing that have meal plan contracts are unable to eat the food due to severe food allergies. Who can these students talk about getting out of their meal plan?

QUESTIONS FROM THE FLOOR

ASM 24-8 November 19, 2024 Page 2

QUESTIONS FROM THE FLOOR (continued)

INTENT TO RAISE QUESTIONS

Responses were provided by Interim Provost Bippus and Interim VP Lindow.

3. Chair Avramchuk provided the following response from Claudio Lindow, Interim CFO/VP of Administration and Finance to Senator Riggio's intent to raise questions from the meeting of October 22, 2024 (ASM 24-6):

Commencement 2022 and 2023 were held at Lot 5 to accommodate the COVID-19 guidelines for large gatherings. With the campus's commitment to provide a covered venue to protect students, faculty, staff, and guests from the heat, the largest tent that would accommodate our needs only allowed for 4 – 5 tickets per student. President Eanes received significant student feedback via emails and personal conversations requesting a change in the commencement venue for 2024. Students passionately expressed that their commencement be held in a proper venue, that more tickets be provided, and that the experience not be in a parking lot.

Addressing these requests, the Spring 2024 commencement ceremonies at the Los Angeles Convention Center cost \$1,345,163 (excluding the Honors Convocation allocation to the colleges).

By comparison, the total cost of commencement ceremonies on campus in 2022-2023 was \$1,274,285 (also excluding the Honors Convocation allocation to the colleges).

While there is a difference of \$70,878 in costs for holding the ceremony at the convention center. This calculation does not account for inflation. Applying a 3.2% Consumer Price Index (CPI) adjustment for FY 2024, the projected additional cost of \$40,777 for hosting commencement in the parking lot brings the total estimated cost to approximately \$1,315,062. This adjustment narrows the cost gap for holding the commencement at the Convention Center to \$30,101.

These figures were provided by James Cuaresma, who reports commencement expenses to the budget office annually. Below are the specific budget details ceremonies:

INTENT TO RAISE QUESTIONS (continued)

Expense Category	Description	FY 2022- 2023	FY 2023- 2024
Commencement Expenses	Venue	\$120,664	\$138,015
	LAPD	_	\$43,322
	Parking	-	\$10,850
	A/V	\$313,091	\$422,402
	Bleachers/Fencing/Restrooms	\$85,771	\$25,000
	Crowd Control	\$79,550	\$125,338
	Public Safety	\$113,462	\$25,296
	Shuttles	-	\$18,725
	Ambulance Service	\$42,190	\$26,596
	Show Ready Expo	-	\$74,909
	Wi-Fi & Hardwire Connection	-	\$52,865
	Electrical	-	\$48,811
	Cleaning Service	-	\$14,856
	Materials/Services	\$23,370	\$20,900
	Hotels	-	\$13,174
	Decorations	\$33,061	\$12,483
	Gold Cords	\$13,195	\$14,744
	Ticketing	\$26,639	\$36,999
	Sign Language Service	\$2,485	\$3,833
	Rentals	\$131,131	\$57,853
	Facilities	\$115,000	\$6,000
	Name Callers	\$10,150	\$9,850
	Ushers	\$1,500	\$5,456
	Supplies	\$7,627	\$5,165
	Student Assistants	\$11,175	\$7,192
Reprographics	Printing, Banners, etc.	\$50,115	\$12,519
Hospitality	Hospitality Services, Water	\$72,260	\$88,336
Miscellaneous	Other costs	\$21,849	\$23,674
Overall Commencement Total		\$1,274,285	\$1,345,163

3.2 Chair Avramchuk provided the following response from the President's cabinet to Senator Wells' intent to raise questions from the meeting of Noember 10, 2024 (ASM 24-3):

The university has not undergone a budget assessment or realignment in at least 10 years, resulting in a de facto incremental budgeting model. We intend to embark on a consultative process of budget assessment and realignment consistent with best practices in higher education. This will include benchmarking academic program costs (e.g., "The Delaware Cost Study") as well as clearly tying the budget to enrollment on a dynamic basis.

We anticipate beginning the process this Spring and will provide updates on the campus Financial Transparency website: https://www.calstatela.edu/financial-transparency

ASM 24-8 November 19, 2024 Page 4

INTENT TO RAISE QUESTIONS (continued)

3.3 Senator Ramos announced her intention to raise the following questions:

Post-election Protection of our students, faculty, staff and communities at Cal State
LA and Amplify University Wide communication as a Practice of Care and
Belonging.

Dear President Eanes.

At Cal State LA we have a unique demographic of students, faculty and staff including immigrants, children of immigrants and first-generation college students and faculty. After the Presidential election of Donald Trump on November 5th 2024 we faculty had an immediate crisis to navigate with our students in the classroom, and as colleagues who were concerned about the future of teaching in a safe space under the immediate threat of mass deportations. As faculty many of us dialogued about our duty to protect our undocumented Students (Black, Latinx, Indigenous, Asian, Arab, and Muslim) and their Mix Status Families at Cal State LA. We discussed our duty to protect our Trans/Queer Students at Cal State LA and our duty to Protect our Black Students at Cal State LA. All these groups of students, faculty and staff felt increased misrepresentation, fear, anxiety, both on campus, in the city, and examples of hate via social media virtual spaces.

Cal State LA has the highest number of undocumented students in the CSU system. We have DACA students, undocumented students and mix-status families and communities. Mix status means that there may be undocumented and U.S. citizen family members or family members with Temporary Protected Status (TPS). Many family members on "protected status" may be deported if TPS is eliminated in 2025. Trump is set to launch a mass deportation of undocumented folks and the newly appointed "Border Patrol Czar" Tom Homan and Stephen Miller, Deputy Chief of Staff for Policy, have made clear the closing of the border and creating huge detention camps in California, thus separating families and children and derailing the lives of millions, during these mass deportations. These are real and palpable threats to our students, faculty, staff, and communities in Los Angeles. In 2017, at the beginning and during Donald Trump's first term, our CSULA students, faculty, and staff, experienced incredible harm, anxiety and depression and rise of racism, social inequities, threats of deportation and access to safe campus space. After the election on November 5, 2024, many faculty, students, and staff felt re-traumatized and reported a rise in fear, anxiety, and sadness due to the threat of mass deportations and increased racist and trans/homophobic acting out of white supremacy ideology. Many Black students in the CSU and across the nation received horrific threats of racism on their social media platforms and emails. As faculty teaching on campus the first few post-election days were quiet, the campus empty, bleak, and students in class sharing their fears when allowed space to process in class. More than a few students, undocumented, trans/queer, stayed home in fear and shock that their vulnerability and safety was now compromised on a new level.

Students then and now post-election are concerned about ICE and Homeland Security on our Campus. Our LA City Council recently elected Chief McDonnell as new LAPD chief. Many immigrant rights groups, workers, and community members are raising concerns about his history interacting with the immigrant community. When Chief McDonnell was Los Angeles County Sheriff, he worked with ICE to deport undocumented Angelenos, and opposed a sanctuary policy at the state level. In addition to ICE, many Black & Latinx students are concerned about further policing and terror from LAPD and the Sheriff's Dept.

During the first Trump term in office CSULA faculty, students and staff organized to protect our students and families and our Erika J. Dreamer's Center then developed a connection to Immigration resources e.g. CARECEN to support our students. To meet the crisis then President Covino immediately sent university wide communication regarding immigration threats and University advocacy which lasted through the Trump administration and into the Biden Administration See link: https://www.calstatela.edu/immigration/messages-university-community On November 8th we received your university-wide President's message about the election, the success of voting on campus, and shared that post-election we would have diverse opinions and feelings. You shared that if we needed support that our

ASM 24-8 November 19,2024 Page 5

INTENT TO RAISE QUESTIONS (continued)

students could reach out to student mental health services. There was no mention about the crisis on campus with our students, faculty and staff in relation to mass-deportations, immigration, heightened anti-Blackness and anti-Trans/Queer discrimination.

When well-intentioned messages repeatedly reduce our students needs to "individual" mental health support as a solution, it deflects from the systemic support in leadership. At Cal State LA this reads as awkward when CSULA has one of the worst ratios of mental health counselors to students in the CSU system. We as a university wide community—students, faculty, and staff-- represent the multi-generational immigrant vibrancy of LA and we need a collective and harm free and safety vision for our communities.

Via a fellow faculty member I found out about our post-election "Dreamer's Center" and CARECEN-led immigration zoom meeting on November 12th. This meeting was siloed on the Dreamer's Center webpage. It was attended by 125 students, faculty and staff. I shared the meeting invite (as did others) with all my students and as many colleagues as possible. None who knew that this meeting was happening. The post-election immigration zoom was not communicated as a university-wide message from you President Eanes or the Dreamers Center staff when this was affecting our students, faculty and staff since November 5th.

Beyond a post-election request to amplify a holistic university wide communication practice of care & belonging, I have the following post-election questions:

- 1) Why did CSULA students, faculty, and staff not receive a "university-wide" message from you, President Eanes addressing and acknowledging the state of well-being and care for our students, faculty and staff during this post-election immigration threat of mass deportations, anti-Trans/Queer and anti-Black threats on our campus and in LA when our students, in particular, were experiencing heightened fear, grief, depression, and for some feeling incapacitated to do academic work or leave their living spaces?
- 2) How will you protect and care for our undocumented, Black, Latinx, Asian, Indigenous, Arab, and Muslim students and all students on campus (including dorms)?
- 3) How will you protect our undocumented students from Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) from entering our campus (including dorms)?
- 4) How will you lead our Campus Police to protect students from LAPD and Sheriff Department working with ICE and the amplification of excessive force, surveillance, and policing if that occurs from now until the end of the 2028 Olympics in Los Angeles?
- 5) How will you protect and care for Trans/Queer students on Campus?
- 6) How will you protect and care for our Black students and increased white supremacy violence and hate on campus?
- 7) How will you protect and care for our students from invited speakers who promote "uncare" and "unbelonging" for our students, faculty, and staff on campus?
- 8) As many LA immigrant groups, students, faculty, and staff advocate against mass deportations and separation of families, how will our "We Are LA" brand embrace our "LA as Sanctuary" advocacy on campus and in Los Angeles?
- 3.4 Senator Oropeza Fujimoto announced her intent to raise the following questions: As we move further through the fall 2024 semester, faculty and staff continue to learn more about the \$32 million deficit announced to the campus in July 2024. In addition to the cuts already imposed in Fall 2024, the administration has expressed plans for additional cuts for Spring 2025, and a *hiring freeze*. Faculty, staff and students are understandably concerned about the impacts these cut have and will have on our campus community.

Questions for President Berenecea Johnson Eanes;

- 1. What is the current balance for Cal State LA's
 - a. unrestricted reserves?
 - b. liquidity portfolio?
 - c. When and how would these funds be used to support quality education and services for the Cal State LA community?

ASM 24-8 November 19, 2024 Page 6

INTENT TO RAISE QUESTIONS (continued)

- 2. How did Cal State LA go from a \$49 million operating budget surplus and an \$8 million surplus in auxiliary services in Spring 2023 to a \$32 million deficit in Summer 2024? Where did \$81 million go?
- 3. Cal State LA heavily relies on the work of Lecturers. Due to the cancellation of many course sections in Fall 2024 and elevated course caps, how many Lecturer faculty members
 - lost their jobs?
 - b. Did not receive their entitlement?
 - Lost their health care?
- 4. What is the current policy for the implementation of S-factor (4990) courses, and have deans and chairs been directed to reduce and/or eliminate their use?
- Do you have plans and/or are you in discussions to 5.
 - Merge departments?
 - Eliminate programs? b.

If so, how and with whom are these decisions being made?

APPROVAL OF THE **MINUTES**

- It was m/s/ (Battle) to approve the minutes of November 5, 2024 (ASM 24-7) 4. 4.1
 - 4.2 Senator Meyerott advised that she was marked absent but was present.
 - Senator Bettcher advised that she was marked absent and should have been noted 4.3 with an Excused Absence.
 - 4.4 The minutes were approved as amended.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

5. It was m/s/p (Meyerott) to approve the agenda.

SENATE CHAIR'S REPORT

- THE CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, LOS ANGELES, FACULTY HANDBOOK, CHAPTER I (24-5.1) – CONSENT ITEM
- PROPOSED POLICY MOD-IFICATION: ELECTRONIC **RECORDING OF CLASS-**ROOM LECTURES AND CLASSROOM ACTIVITIES, FACULTY HANDBOOK, CHAPTER V (22-18.2) Second-Reading Item Forwarded to the President

- Chair Avramchuk presented his report. 6.
- 7. Chair Avramchuk presented the revised document and provided an overview to the body. No objections were raised.
- 8. 8.1 It was m/s/ (Porter) in line 78 to delete AND MAY BE SHARED OUTSIDE OF CLASS after "OCCURING" and insert FACULTY SHALL OBTAIN EXPLICIT STUDENT APPROVAL PRIOR TO SHARING CLASS RECORDING OUTSIDE OF CLASS. after "CONVERSATIONS".
 - It was m/ (Harris) to commit the proposed amendment back to the Educational 8.2. Policy Committee for their review and that they give a report back to the Senate by the meeting on February 25.
 - 8.3 Debate ensued. The Harris motion died for lack of a second.
 - 8.4 The Porter motion was APPROVED. (V: 24/8/6)
 - 8.5 It was m/s/p (Wells) in line 88 to replace SHOULD with MUST. (V: 34/1/3)
 - 8.6 It was m/s/ (Harris) in line 81 to insert FACULTY MUST NOTIFY STUDENTS IF A RECORDING WILL BE USED OUTSIDE OF CLASS after "COURSE.".
 - 8.7 Debate ensued. The Harris motion FAILED. (V: 14/21/4)
 - The recommendation was APPROVED. (V: 33/1/4) 8.8

ASM 24-8 November 19,2024 Page 7

ACADEMIC SENATE RESOLUTION CONDEMN-ING THE EXPANSION OF ADMININSTRATIVE POLICIES UNDERMINING THE RIGHT TO PEACEFUL CAMPUS PROTEST (24-7) Second-Reading Item

- 9. It was m/s/ (Porter) in line 89 to insert BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT THE UNIVERSITY DEVELOPS A REVISED POLICY WITH FACULTY, STUDENT, AND STAFF INPUT.
 - 9.2 Debate ensued.
 - 9.3 Senator Trzaskoma suggested an editorial change of removing the "S" from DEVELOPS. No objections were raised.
 - 9.4 It was m/s/ (Meyerott) to amend the Porter motion by inserting USE SHARED GOVENANCE PROCESSES TO REVISE POLICY AND ENSURE COLLABORATION after "UNIVERSITY" and deleting <u>DEVELOP A REVISED POLICY</u>.
 - 9.5 Debate ensued. The Meyerott amendment to the Porter motion was APPROVED. (V:33/1/1)
 - 9.6 The Porter motion was APPROVED as amended. (V: 32/2/2)
 - 9.7 It was m/s/ (Baaske) to delete lines 48-53 Whereas, faculty recognizes that while the free and open exchange of ideas—regardless of their popularity or potential to provoke is essential to critical thinking, intellectual growth, and the advancement of knowledge and remembers the failure of Cal State LA to protect the campus from anti-immigrant "free speech" by abdicating it's responsibility to guide or moderate dialogue or model civil discourse so that the "free speech" did not digress into personal attacks and distress faculty, students, and staff¹; and and footnote 7 ⁷ Littleton, C. (2019), The True Cost of Free Speech. University Times "On the morning of Monday, April 22, a large banner stood outside the campus bookstore messily sprayed-painted with the phrase "Build the Wall." The Young Americans for Freedom student organization sponsored a speaker that gave a speech on the necessity of border security in the country. The speaker, Michael Knowles, "interrupted and disrespected every single person who came up to ask questions with intentions of fair debate. He even went so far as to question the intelligence of faculty members who disagreed with him and condemned the future of the school based on the incompetence of our professors." University through its protocols "did not create a safe and fair environment" for student learning.
 - 9.8 Debate ensued.
 - 9.9 It was m/s/ (Baaske) to continue this as a Second-Reading Item at the next meeting. No objections were raised.
- 10. It was m/s/ (Baaske) to adjourn at 3:46 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT